HISTORIC AMERICAN LANDSCAPES SURVEY

PHILADELPHIA NATIONAL CEMETERY, LODGE

HALS No. PA-2-B

<u>Location</u>: Haines Street and Limekiln Pike, Philadelphia, Philadelphia County, Pennsylvania.

The coordinates for the Philadelphia National Cemetery, are 75.155234 W and 40.059337 N, and they were obtained in August 2012 with, it is assumed, NAD 1983. There is no restriction on the release of the locational data to the public.

Present Owner: National Cemetery Administration, U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs.

Prior to 1988, the U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs was known as the Veterans Administration.

The Veterans Administration took over management of Philadelphia National Cemetery from the U.S. Army in 1973 (Public Law 93-43).

Date: 1934, demolished after 1982.

Builder/Contractor: Unknown.

<u>Description</u>: The Dutch Colonial Revival style lodge was the second lodge on the grounds; the house belonging to the estate that became the nexus of the national cemetery served as the first lodge. The Italianate style building was stone and materials from the building were salvaged for the purpose-built lodge in 1934. PWA funds financed part of the construction of the Dutch Colonial Revival style lodge, and this lodge was razed after 1982.

The lodge built in 1934 was a Dutch Colonial Revival style building made of brick and covered with a gambrel roof. A two-window dormer distinguished the second floor on the front elevation whereas pilasters of brick, and the columns of the integral porch, divided the first floor into bays. The windows were glazed with multiple panes, six lights in the upper sash of the windows on the front facade, however the maintenance ledgers kept for the Veterans Administration referred to casement windows in the building. Seven casements were repaired in 1964, for example. There was also a brick chimney.

The building was painted, inside and outside, at routine intervals up to and through the 1960s. The tile floor was repaired in 1941, Venetian blinds were added in 1948, and the gutters and storm door were fixed in 1967. Wiring was upgraded in 1936 and again in 1963.

<u>Site Context</u>: The national cemetery occupies a nearly rectangular plot of land, and park-like pathways meander from the entrance gates at the corner of Haines Street and Limekiln Pike. The cemetery is surrounded by a low stone wall. A historic photograph shows the Italianate house, repurposed as the superintendent's lodge, viewed from just outside the gates and the 1892 map of

PHILDELPHIA NATIONAL CEMETERY, LODGE HALS No. PA-2-B (page 2)

the cemetery indicates the building faced south. The cartographer placed it in the center of a circular drive, much like that occupied by the flagpole today, and seemingly farther away from the entrance at the east corner. The barn, repurposed as a tool house in 1934, was located against the north wall of the property in the same location as the present service building. The tool house was razed in 1955. Although the records do not indicate where on the property the Dutch Colonial Revival lodge was built, or the direction it faced, likely it occupied the same ground as the former country house.

<u>History</u>: Please see the contextual report for an analysis of the architectural development of the lodge as a building type for the national cemeteries and its place within this prescribed landscape (HALS No. DC-46).

In 1862 Congress authorized the appropriation of land for use as national cemeteries so that the Union soldiers who perished in service to their country could be buried with honor. These became the first cemeteries in the national cemetery system; by the end of the decade almost 300,000 men were buried in seventy-three national cemeteries. By that time the Office of the Quartermaster General, and the Quartermaster Montgomery C. Meigs in particular, had developed an architectural program for the cemetery. The program created for the national cemeteries included an enclosing wall demarcating the grounds and ornamental iron gates cast to instill reverence to those who entered and calm the wrought emotions of a nation in mourning for its lost sons. Specific plantings, such as the Osage-orange hedge and various trees, were selected to give a pleasing appearance and, likely, to screen outbuildings - the business of cemetery maintenance - from public view. Less a commemorative architectural statement, the superintendent's lodge combined practicality with a respectful presence.

Lodge plans first evolved from expedient wood-frame "cottages" to masonry buildings one-story in height and with a three-room floor plan. Construction of the temporary wood-frame lodges took place in the years 1867 to 1869, and overlapped with the construction of the first permanent masonry lodges built to a standard, single-story design from 1868 to 1871. Officers in charge of the cemeteries soon found the floor plans of the temporary wood lodges and the first permanent masonry lodges inconvenient and, increasingly, unattractive.

Moreover, representatives from the Quartermaster General's Office noted these three-room models were often too small for a superintendent and his family, and so in 1869, plans for a sixroom, one and one-half story type were acquired from Edward Clark, Architect of the Capitol Extension. The design was refined over the next two years and in 1871 drawn for the Quartermaster General Montgomery C. Meigs's approval. This standard plan featured a mansard roof and so became associated with the French or Second Empire style. Contemporary buildings, domestic and civic, exhibited this aesthetic and so the choice of the Quartermaster for a Second Empire style lodge is in keeping with national architectural trends as well as the personal taste of Meigs whose house also was erected in the Second Empire style. On the national stage, Alfred Mullet designed the Old Executive Office building in Washington, DC, a building whose construction in the 1870s coincided with the building of lodges in the Second Empire style in many of the national cemeteries.

PHILDELPHIA NATIONAL CEMETERY, LODGE HALS No. PA-2-B (page 3)

The National Cemetery Administration identifies the Second Empire style lodge, referred to in the 1880s as the "usual" type, or even the "full Meigs plan" likely in reference to the Quartermaster's endorsement of the design, as the first generation of permanent lodges. It reflects a concerted effort to standardize what a national cemetery, including the lodge, should look like. The last cemeteries for which the Quartermaster contracted for this style of lodge were for Mobile, Alabama, and Beaufort, South Carolina, in 1881.

The L-plan was revised in 1885 for the lodge in San Francisco, and then employed for the lodges in Mound City and Loudon Park. The revised plan was further improved for the construction of the lodge at Cypress Hills. The revision to the standard L-plan primarily included a change in roof form from the mansard to a cross-gable and the use of banded brick in the exterior walls. Cypress Hills was a simpler expression of the type, with segmental arches over the windows instead of stone lintels and having no banded exterior brick in the walls. In the 1890s, the plans called for an elongated office wing. This change to the L-plan accommodated an entrance hall in the middle of the building; the elongated L-plan was built in Santa Fe, Fort Smith, and Fort Leavenworth.

By the century's end, standards of living called for conveniences the L-plan lodges lacked. Advances in plumbing and heating technologies, in particular, made the L-plan outdated as expectations about the appropriate level of domestic sanitation that the government should provide to its employees changed. Even so, the Quartermaster omitted indoor toilets from the lodge floor plans until 1905. Maintenance of the existing lodges, as well as ell additions, addressed some of the inconveniences of the older buildings, and made the lodges more comfortable as living spaces. Between the 1880s and 1940s, improvements to the existing lodges included the installation of indoor plumbing and bathrooms, central heating, closets and cupboards; adding a kitchen ell and converting the original kitchen into a dining room; and maintenance of windows, shutters, and porches.

By 1905, the Quartermaster determined some lodges warranted a complete overall, rather than renovation, and the department began to replace some of the buildings in the national cemeteries. For the new lodges, it created a succession of twenty-two different plans between 1905 and 1960. Nine of these plans were used to build multiple lodges, but thirteen were unique designs, used only once. Compared to the extended popularity of the L-plan, which lasted from 1870 to 1881 in its mansard-roof form and to 1904 in its later variations, the rapid succession of designs in the twentieth century suggests a new awareness among those directing the cemeteries of the need to construct lodges that were aesthetically and technologically up-to-date. Over five decades, the Quartermaster endorsed a progression of plans from four-squares to bungalows to Colonial Revival designs and then to suburban ramblers. This progression paralleled the changes in form, style, building materials, and construction practices that occurred in the private housing market.

Most of the lodges built in the twentieth century are indistinguishable from typical American middle-class and upper-middle-class suburban dwellings, with the exception of a second entrance for the superintendent's office. In some instances, such as in Hampton, Virginia, and in Annapolis, Maryland, the army made a particular effort to match new lodges to their local

surroundings, usually by building period-revival designs in places where those designs would have particular resonance. In a nod to the colonial heritage of the Chesapeake, the Quartermaster built one-and-one-half-story brick lodges in a Colonial Revival style at these cemeteries in 1940. In another example, the desire to match designs to localities prompted the alteration of the L-plan lodge at San Francisco into a Spanish Mission Revival building in 1929 and the similarly extensive reconstruction of the Santa Fe lodge into the Pueblo Revival style in 1942.

Of the twentieth-century lodge forms, the design in the Dutch Colonial Revival oeuvre was selected most often. Fourteen lodges were built using this plan between 1921 and 1934. The design called for a one and one-half story building with masonry construction at the first floor and wood-frame gambrel roofs enclosing the upper floor. The building footprint was rectangular and included an enclosed porch and office in the front, a living room and stair in the middle, and a dining room and kitchen at the rear. The second floor contained three bedrooms and a bathroom opening off of a central hall. Three versions of the design were used. The first in four lodges erected between 1921 and 1928, with hollow core tile walls covered in stucco, shingled roofs and gable ends, and dormers two windows in width on the front and rear. The second version expanded the dormer from two windows to four, adding more light the upper floor. This plan was used twice, for lodges in Nashville and Chattanooga, in 1931. PWA funds paid for the construction of lodges in 1934, including eight built to a third rendition of the Dutch Colonial Revival design. In 1934, the building materials included a brick construction on the first floor and faux half-timbered or brick gables. The Philadelphia lodge is an example of the third expression of the Dutch Colonial Revival design and cost \$10,034 to build.

Philadelphia National Cemetery was created in 1862, and one of just a few national cemeteries that were established near troop training grounds. The cemetery consisted of seven different burying grounds throughout the city and in 1885 a move was made to consolidate the remains into one larger cemetery on land bought from Henry and Susan Freeman. The dispersed nature of the cemetery in the beginning meant the tools were kept on each individual cemetery site and the guards lived in rented rooms. A lodge was recommended in 1867, and a plan enclosed on a tracing was sent for the cemetery to use as a guide. There may not have been a lodge in 1884, when the inspection report cites the absence of one but it is unclear if the referral was to Lebanon or to Philadelphia National Cemetery. By 1888, a three-story building made of stone was in use as the lodge. It was spacious, with six rooms plus the hall on the first floor, and five rooms plus the bathroom on the second floor and another series of rooms in the attic. Unfortunately, due to an old leak, the walls on the second floor were stained and the paper was peeling off. Eight hundred dollars was spent the previous year repairing the roof so no requests for refinishing or redecorating were entertained. There was a well for water in the cellar, as well as a brick furnace. In the 1889 survey of the national cemeteries, this lodge was described as being three stories, of stone, with a slate roof. The lighting was by gas.

Sources:

Annual Report of the Secretary of War. [to Congress]. Washington, DC: GPO, 1865-1920.

Deetz, James. In Small Things Forgotten: The Archaeology of Early American Life. New York:

Doubleday, 1977.

- Dickinson, William C., Dean A. Herrin, and Donald R. Kennon, eds. *Montgomery C. Meigs and the Building of the Nation's Capital*. Athens: University of Ohio Press for the U.S. Capitol Historical Society, 2001.
- General Correspondence and Reports Relating to National and Post Cemeteries, 1865-ca. 1914, Record Group 92, Records of the Office of the Quartermaster General, National Archives Building, Washington, DC.
- Holt, Dean W. American Military Cemeteries: A Comprehensive Illustrated Guide to the Hallowed Grounds of the United States, Including Cemeteries Overseas. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, Inc., Publishers, 1992.
- Message of the President of the United States [to Congress]. Washington, DC: GPO, 1862-63.
- Meyer, Richard E., ed. Cemeteries and Gravemarkers: Voices of American Culture. Logan: Utah State University Press, 1992.
- National Cemetery Historical File, Department of Memorial Affairs, Record Group 15, Records of the Veterans Administration, National Archives Building, Washington, DC.
- Sloane, David Charles. *The Last Great Necessity: Cemeteries in American History*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1991.
- Zipf, Catherine W. "Marking Union Victory in the South: The Construction of the National Cemetery System." In *Monuments to the Lost Cause: Women, Art, and the Landscapes of Southern Memory*, edited by Cynthia Mills and Pamela H. Simpson. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 2003.

Historian: Virginia B. Price, 2012.

<u>Project Information</u>: The documentation of the lodges and rostrums in the national cemeteries was undertaken by the Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS), one of the Heritage Documentation Programs of the National Park Service, Richard O'Connor, Chief. The project was sponsored by the National Cemetery Administration (NCA) of the U. S. Department of Veterans Affairs, Sara Amy Leach, Senior Historian. Project planning was coordinated by Catherine C. Lavoie, Chief of HABS. Historical research was undertaken by HABS Historians Virginia B. Price and Michael R. Harrison. NCA Historians Jennifer Perunko, Alec Bennett, and Hillori Schenker provided research material, edited and reviewed written reports. Field work for selected sites was carried out and measured drawings produced by HABS Architects Paul Davidson, Ryan Pierce, and Mark Schara.